

1 ROB BONTA
2 Attorney General of California
3 NICKLAS A. AKERS (SBN 211222)
4 BERNARD A. ESKANDARI (SBN 224395)
5 Supervising Deputy Attorney General
6 MEGAN O'NEILL (SBN 343535)
7 JOSHUA OLSZEWSKI-JUBELIRER (SBN 336428)
8 MARISSA ROY (SBN 318773)
9 Deputy Attorneys General
10 455 Golden Gate Ave., 11th Fl.
11 San Francisco, CA 94102
12 Telephone: (415) 510-4400
13 Fax: (415) 703-5480
14 E-mail: Bernard.Eskandari@doj.ca.gov
15 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of*
16 *California*

[List of additional counsel on
signature page]

17 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
18 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
19 OAKLAND DIVISION

20 **STATE OF ARIZONA, *ex rel.* KRIS
21 MAYES, ATTORNEY GENERAL;**

Case No. 4:23-cv-05448-YGR

22 **THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF
23 CALIFORNIA;**

Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

24 **STATE OF COLORADO, *ex rel.* PHILIP J.
25 WEISER, ATTORNEY GENERAL;**

26 **STATE OF CONNECTICUT;**
27 **STATE OF DELAWARE, *ex rel.*
28 KATHLEEN JENNINGS,
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF
DELAWARE;**

**PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE
MOTION TO DETERMINE WHETHER
DEFENDANT META PLATFORMS,
INC.'S MATERIALS SHOULD BE
SEALED**

29 **STATE OF GEORGIA *ex rel.*
30 CHRISTOPHER M. CARR, ATTORNEY
31 GENERAL OF THE STATE OF GEORGIA;**

32 **STATE OF HAWAI'I, *ex rel.* ANNE E.
33 LOPEZ, ATTORNEY GENERAL;**

34 **STATE OF IDAHO, through ATTORNEY
35 GENERAL RAÚL R. LABRADOR;**

36 **THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF
37 ILLINOIS;**

38 **STATE OF INDIANA;**

1 **STATE OF KANSAS, *ex rel.* KRIS W.**
2 **KOBACH, Attorney General;**
3 **THE COMMONWEALTH OF**
4 **KENTUCKY;**
5 **STATE OF LOUISIANA;**
6 **STATE OF MAINE;**
7 **OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL**
8 **OF MARYLAND;**
9 **STATE OF MICHIGAN *ex rel.* DANA**
10 **NESSEL, ATTORNEY GENERAL;**
11 **STATE OF MINNESOTA, by its**
12 **ATTORNEY GENERAL, KEITH ELLISON;**
13 **STATE OF MISSOURI, *ex rel.* ANDREW**
14 **BAILEY, ATTORNEY GENERAL;**
15 **STATE OF NEBRASKA *ex rel.* MICHAEL**
16 **T. HILGERS, ATTORNEY GENERAL;**
17 **MATTHEW J. PLATKIN, ATTORNEY**
18 **GENERAL FOR THE STATE OF NEW**
19 **JERSEY, AND CARI FAIS, ACTING**
20 **DIRECTOR OF THE NEW JERSEY**
21 **DIVISION OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS;**
22 **THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW**
23 **YORK, by LETITIA JAMES, ATTORNEY**
24 **GENERAL OF THE STATE OF NEW**
25 **YORK;**
26 **STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, *ex rel.***
27 **JOSHUA H. STEIN, ATTORNEY**
28 **GENERAL;**
29 **STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA, *ex rel.***
30 **DREW WRIGLEY, ATTORNEY GENERAL;**
31 **STATE OF OHIO, *ex rel.* ATTORNEY**
32 **GENERAL DAVE YOST;**
33 **STATE OF OREGON *ex rel.* ELLEN F.**
34 **ROSENBLUM, ATTORNEY GENERAL**
35 **FOR THE STATE OF OREGON;**
36 **COMMONWEALTH OF**
37 **PENNSYLVANIA**
38 **BY ATTORNEY GENERAL MICHELLE A.**
39 **HENRY;**

STATE OF RHODE ISLAND;

**STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA, *ex. rel.*
ALAN M. WILSON, IN HIS OFFICIAL
CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF
THE STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA;**

STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA *ex rel.*
MARTY J. JACKLEY, SOUTH DAKOTA
ATTORNEY GENERAL;

**COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA,
ex rel. JASON S. MIYARES,
ATTORNEY GENERAL;**

**STATE OF WASHINGTON, *ex rel.*
ROBERT W. FERGUSON, ATTORNEY
GENERAL;**

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, *ex rel.*
PATRICK MORRISEY, ATTORNEY
GENERAL; and

STATE OF WISCONSIN.

Plaintiffs.

v.

META PLATFORMS, INC.

INSTAGRAM, LLC.

META PAYMENTS, INC.; and

META PLATFORMS TECHNOLOGIES, LLC

Defendants

Under Civil Local Rules 7-11 and 79-5(f), Plaintiffs Arizona; the People of the State of California (“California”); Colorado; Connecticut; Delaware; Georgia; Hawai‘i; Idaho; the People of the State of Illinois, by and through Attorney General Kwame Raoul; Indiana; Kansas; Kentucky; Louisiana; Maine; Office of the Attorney General of Maryland; Michigan; State of Minnesota, by its Attorney General, Keith Ellison; Missouri; Nebraska; Matthew J. Platkin,

1 Attorney General for the State of New Jersey, and Cari Fais, Acting Director of the New Jersey
 2 Division of Consumer Affairs; New York; North Carolina; North Dakota, ex rel. Drew H.
 3 Wrigley, Attorney General; Ohio; Oregon; Pennsylvania; Rhode Island; South Carolina; South
 4 Dakota; Virginia; Washington; West Virginia; and Wisconsin (collectively, “Filing States”)
 5 submit this administrative motion to consider whether materials designated as confidential by
 6 Defendant Meta Platforms, Inc. (“Meta”) should be sealed, specifically certain allegations
 7 included in the Filing States’ complaint [Dkt. No. 1], identified in Exhibit A.

8 The Filing States’ complaint contains and refers to materials produced by Meta during the
 9 course of the Filing States’ investigation and designated by Meta as “Confidential.” The Filing
 10 States have agreed to file their complaint against Meta conditionally under seal, to the extent
 11 allowed by the Local Rules. The portions of the Complaint that contain materials or references to
 12 materials that Meta has designated as “Confidential” are identified in the table in Exhibit A.

13 Therefore, in accordance Civil Local Rule 79-5(f), the Filing States move the Court to
 14 determine whether the portions of the Complaint designated in Exhibit A should be sealed. Meta
 15 solely bears the burden of establishing that any or all of the referenced material is sealable. The
 16 Filing States take no position at this time on whether, and do not concede that, any of the
 17 referenced material satisfies the requirements for filing under seal.

18 As required by Civil Local Rule 79-5(f), the Filing States have filed a redacted version of
 19 the complaint on the public docket. An unredacted version containing highlighting where
 20 redactions were made in the redacted version of the complaint is attached as Exhibit B and
 21 provisionally filed under seal. In support of this motion, the Filing States include the Declaration
 22 of Bernard A. Eskandari, counsel to California.

23 Finally, under the Local Rules, a motion for an order for Administrative Relief must
 24 include, among other things, a proposed order (concurrently filed with this motion) and either a
 25 stipulation under Civil Local Rule 7-12 or a declaration that explains why a stipulation could not
 26 be obtained. In this case, this motion is being filed contemporaneously with the opening of this
 27 case and the filing of the Filing States’ complaint. Accordingly, Meta (and other Defendants) had
 28 yet to appear when the Filing States filed their conditionally redacted complaint, and therefore

1 counsel was unable to confer with Defendants to obtain a stipulation. Counsel to California
2 concurrently files his declaration attesting to these facts in support of this motion. Further,
3 because Meta (nor any Defendant) has yet to appear, the Filing States will serve this motion and
4 related documents on Defendants consistent with Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure
5 and file a separate proof of service upon doing so.

6

7

Dated: October 24, 2023

8

9

KRIS MAYES
Attorney General
State of Arizona

10

/s/ Vince Rabago
Vince Rabago (AZ No. 015522 CA No.
167033) *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if
required*
Chief Counsel - Consumer Protection and
Advocacy Section
Nathan Whelihan (AZ No. 037560) *pro hac
vice app. forthcoming, if required*
Assistant Attorney General
Arizona Attorney General's Office
2005 North Central Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85004
Phone: (602) 542-3725
Fax: (602) 542-4377
Vince.Rabago@azag.gov
Nathan.Whelihan@azag.gov

11

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Arizona

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

Respectfully submitted,

ROB BONTA
Attorney General
State of California

/s/ Bernard A. Eskandari
Nicklas A. Akers (CA SBN 211222)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Bernard A. Eskandari (CA SBN 244395)
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
Megan O'Neill (CA SBN 343535)
Joshua Olszewski-Jubelirer
(CA SBN 336428)
Marissa Roy (CA SBN 318773)
Deputy Attorneys General
California Department of Justice
Office of the Attorney General
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000
San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
Phone: (415) 510-4400
Fax: (415) 703-5480
Bernard.Eskandari@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State
of California*

1 **PHILIP J. WEISER**
2 Attorney General
3 State of Colorado

4 /s/ Bianca E. Miyata
5 Bianca E. Miyata, CO Reg. No. 42012,
6 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
7 Senior Assistant Attorney General
8 Lauren M. Dickey, CO Reg. No. 45773
9 First Assistant Attorney General
10 Megan Paris Rundlet, CO Reg. No. 27474
11 Senior Assistant Solicitor General
12 Elizabeth Orem, CO Reg. No. 58309
13 Assistant Attorney General
14 Colorado Department of Law
15 Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center
16 Consumer Protection Section
17 1300 Broadway, 7th Floor
18 Denver, CO 80203
19 Phone: (720) 508-6651
20 bianca.miyata@coag.gov

21 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado, ex
22 rel. Philip J. Weiser, Attorney General*

23 **WILLIAM TONG**
24 Attorney General
25 State of Connecticut

26 /s/ Lauren H. Bidra
27 Lauren H. Bidra (CT Juris No. 440552)
28 Special Counsel for Media and Technology
29 *Pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
30 Matthew Fitzsimmons (CT Juris No.
31 426834)
32 Chief Counsel
33 *Pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
34 Connecticut Office of the Attorney General
35 165 Capitol Avenue
36 Hartford, Connecticut 06106
37 Phone: 860-808-5306
38 Fax: 860-808-5593
39 Lauren.Bidra@ct.gov
40 Matthew.Fitzsimmons@ct.gov

41 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Connecticut*

42 **KATHLEEN JENNINGS**
43 Attorney General
44 State of Delaware

45 /s/ Dashiell Raj Radost
46 Owen Lefkon
47 Director of Fraud and Consumer Protection
48 Marion Quirk
49 Director of Consumer Protection
50 Dashiell Radost (DE Bar 7100), *pro hac
51 vice app. forthcoming, if required*
52 Deputy Attorney General,
53 Delaware Department of Justice
54 820 N. French Street, 5th Floor
55 Wilmington, DE 19801
56 Phone: (302) 683-8800
57 Dashiell.Radost@delaware.gov

58 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Delaware*

59 **CHRISTOPHER M. CARR**
60 Attorney General
61 State of Georgia

62 /s/ Melissa M. Devine
63 Melissa M. Devine (GA Bar No. 403670),
64 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
65 Assistant Attorney General
66 Office of the Attorney General of the State
67 of Georgia
68 2 Martin Luther King Jr. Drive, SE, Ste. 356
69 Atlanta, GA 30334
70 Phone: (404) 458-3765
71 Fax: (404) 651-9108
72 mdevine@law.ga.gov

73 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Georgia*

1 **ANNE E. LOPEZ**

2 Attorney General
2 State of Hawai‘i

3 /s/ Bryan C. Yee

4 BRYAN C. YEE (HA JD No. 4050)
5 Supervising Deputy Attorney General
5 CHRISTOPHER T. HAN (HA JD No.
6 11311), *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if*
6 *required*
7 Deputy Attorney General
8 Department of the Attorney General
8 Commerce and Economic Development
9 Division
9 425 Queen Street
10 Honolulu, Hawai‘i 96813
10 Phone: (808) 586-1180
11 Bryan.c.yee@hawaii.gov
11 Christopher.t.han@hawaii.gov

12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Hawai‘i*

14 **RAÚL R. LABRADOR**

15 Attorney General
15 State of Idaho

17 By: /s/ Nathan Nielson

17 Stephanie N. Guyon (ID Bar No. 5989)
18 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
18 Nathan H. Nielson (ID Bar No. 9234)
19 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
19 Deputy Attorneys General
20 Attorney General’s Office
21 P.O. Box 83720
21 Boise, ID 83720-0010
22 (208) 334-2424
22 stephanie.guyon@ag.idaho.gov
23 nathan.nielson@ag.idaho.gov

24 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Idaho*

1 **KWAME RAOUL**

2 Attorney General
2 State of Illinois

3 By: /s/ Susan Ellis

4 **Susan Ellis**, Chief, Consumer Protection
Division (IL Bar No. 6256460)
Greg Grzeskiewicz, Chief, Consumer Fraud
Bureau (IL Bar No. 6272322)
Jacob Gilbert, Deputy Chief, Consumer
Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6306019)
Daniel Edelstein, Supervising Attorney,
Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No.
6328692)
Adam Sokol, Senior Assistant Attorney
General, Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar
No. 6216883)
Hanan Malik, Assistant Attorney General,
Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No.
6316543)
Emily María Migliore, Assistant Attorney
General, Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar
No. 6336392)
Kevin Whelan, Assistant Attorney General,
Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No.
6321715)
Office of the Illinois Attorney General
100 W. Randolph Street
Chicago, Illinois 60601
312-814-2218
Susan.Ellis@ilag.gov
Greg.Grzeskiewicz@ilag.gov
Jacob.Gilbert@ilag.gov
Daniel.Edelstein@ilag.gov
Adam.Sokol@ilag.gov
Hanan.Malik@ilag.gov
Emily.Migliore@ilag.gov
Kevin.Whelan@ilag.gov
*(pro hac vice applications forthcoming, if
required)*

25 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State
of Illinois*

1 **THEODORE E. ROKITA**

2 Attorney General
3 State of Indiana

4 */s/ Scott L. Barnhart*

5 Scott L. Barnhart (IN Atty No. 25474-82)
6 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
7 Chief Counsel and Director of Consumer
8 Protection
9 Corinne Gilchrist (IN Atty No. 27115-53)
10 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
11 Section Chief, Consumer Litigation
12 Mark M. Snodgrass (IN Atty No. 29495-49)
13 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
14 Deputy Attorney General
15 Office of the Indiana Attorney General
16 Indiana Government Center South
17 302 West Washington St., 5th Floor
18 Indianapolis, IN 46203
19 Telephone: (317) 232-6309
20 Scott.Barnhart@atg.in.gov
21 Corinne.Gilchrist@atg.in.gov
22 Mark.Snodgrass@atg.in.gov

23 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Indiana*

24 **KRIS W. KOBACH**

25 Attorney General
26 State of Kansas

27 */s/ Sarah M. Dietz*

28 Sarah Dietz, Assistant Attorney General
1 (KS Bar No. 27457), *pro hac vice*
2 *application forthcoming, if required*
3 Office of the Kansas Attorney General
4 120 SW 10th Avenue, 2nd Floor
5 Topeka, Kansas 66612
6 Telephone: (785) 296-3751
7 sarah.dietz@ag.ks.gov

8 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Kansas*

1 **DANIEL J. CAMERON**

2 Attorney General
3 Commonwealth of Kentucky

4 */s/ J. Christian Lewis*

5 J. CHRISTIAN LEWIS (KY Bar No.
6 87109), *Pro hac vice application*
7 *forthcoming, if required*
8 PHILIP HELERINGER (KY Bar No.
9 96748), *Pro hac vice application*
10 *forthcoming, if required*
11 GREGORY B. LADD (KY Bar No. 95886),
12 *Pro hac vice application forthcoming, if*
13 *required*
14 ZACHARY RICHARDS (KY Bar No.
15 99209), *Pro hac vice application*
16 *forthcoming, if required*
17 ASSISTANT ATTORNEYS GENERAL
18 1024 CAPITAL CENTER DRIVE SUITE
19 200
20 FRANKFORT, KY 40601
21 CHRISTIAN.LEWIS@KY.GOV
22 PHILIP.HELERINGER@KY.GOV
23 GREG.LADD@KY.GOV
24 ZACH.RICHARDS@KY.GOV
25 PHONE: (502) 696-5300
26 FAX: (502) 564-2698

27 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of*
28 *Kentucky*

1 **JEFF LANDRY**
2 Attorney General
3 State of Louisiana

4 */s/ Arham Mughal*
5 Arham Mughal (LA Bar No. 38354), *pro hac*
6 *vice app. forthcoming, if required*
7 L. Christopher Styron (LA Bar No. 30747),
8 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
9 Assistant Attorneys General
10 Louisiana Department of Justice
11 Office of the Attorney General
12 Public Protection Division
13 Consumer Protection Section
14 1885 N 3rd Street, 4th Floor
15 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
16 Tel: (225) 326-6438
17 MughalA@ag.louisiana.gov
18 StyronL@ag.louisiana.gov

19 *Attorneys for State of Louisiana*

20 **AARON M. FREY**
21 Attorney General
22 State of Maine

23 */s/ Brendan F.X. O'Neil*
24 Brendan F.X. O'Neil, Maine Bar No. 9900,
25 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
26 Michael Devine, Maine Bar No. 5048
27 Laura Lee Barry Wommack, Maine Bar No.
28 10110
 Assistant Attorneys General
 Office of the Maine Attorney General
 6 State House Station
 Augusta, ME 04333
 (207) 626-8800
 brendan.oneil@maine.gov
 michael.devine@maine.gov
 lauralee.barrywommack@maine.gov

29 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maine*

30 **ANTHONY G. BROWN**
31 Attorney General
32 State of Maryland

33 */s/ Elizabeth J. Stern*
34 Philip D. Ziperman (Maryland CPF No.
35 9012190379), *pro hac vice app.*
36 *forthcoming, if required*
37 Deputy Chief, Consumer Protection Division
38 Elizabeth J. Stern (Maryland CPF No.
39 1112090003), *pro hac vice app.*
40 *forthcoming, if required*
41 Assistant Attorney General
42 Office of the Attorney General of Maryland
43 200 St. Paul Place
44 Baltimore, MD 21202
45 Phone: (410) 576-6417 (Mr. Ziperman)
46 Phone: (410) 576-7226 (Ms. Stern)
47 Fax: (410) 576-6566
48 pziperman@oag.state.md.us
49 estern@oag.state.md.us

50 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Office of the Attorney*
51 *General of Maryland*

52 **DANA NESSEL**
53 Attorney General
54 State of Michigan

55 */s/ Daniel J. Ping*
56 Daniel J. Ping (P81482), *pro hac vice app.*
57 *forthcoming, if required*
58 Assistant Attorney General
59 Michigan Department of Attorney General
60 Corporate Oversight Division
61 P.O. Box 30736
62 Lansing, MI 48909
63 517-335-7632
64 PingD@michigan.gov

65 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Michigan*

1 **KEITH ELLISON**
2 Attorney General
3 State of Minnesota

4 */s/ James Van Buskirk*
5 JAMES VAN BUSKIRK (MN Bar No.
6 0392513), *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if*
7 *required*
8 Assistant Attorney General
9 Office of the Minnesota Attorney General
10 445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1200
11 St. Paul, MN 55101-2130
12 Tel: (651) 757-1150
13 james.vanbuskirk@ag.state.mn.us

14 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Minnesota, by*
15 *its Attorney General, Keith Ellison*

16 **ANDREW BAILEY**
17 Attorney General
18 State of Missouri

19 By: */s/ Michael Schwalbert*
20 Michael Schwalbert, MO Bar #63229, *pro*
21 *hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
22 Assistant Attorney General
23 Consumer Protection Section
24 Missouri Attorney General's Office
25 815 Olive Street | Suite 200
26 Saint Louis, Missouri 63101
27 michael.schwalbert@ago.mo.gov
28 Phone: 314-340-7888
 Fax: 314-340-7981

1 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Missouri, ex*
2 *rel. Andrew Bailey, Attorney General*

1 **MICHAEL T. HILGERS**
2 Attorney General
3 State of Nebraska

4 */s/ Michaela J. Hohwieler*
5 Michaela J. Hohwieler (NE #26826)
6 Assistant Attorney General
7 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
8 Colin P. Snider (NE #27724)
9 Assistant Attorney General
10 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
11 Nebraska Attorney General's Office
12 2115 State Capitol Building
13 Lincoln, NE 68509
14 Phone: (402) 471-3840
15 Email: michaela.hohwieler@nebraska.gov
16 Email: colin.snider@nebraska.gov

17 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Nebraska*

18 **MATTHEW J. PLATKIN**
19 Attorney General
20 State of New Jersey

21 By: */s/ Kashif T. Chand*
22 Kashif T. Chand (NJ Bar No. 016752008),
23 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
24 Chief, Deputy Attorney General
25 New Jersey Office of the Attorney General,
26 Division of Law
27 124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor
28 Newark, NJ 07101
 Tel: (973) 648-2052
 Kashif.Chand@law.njoag.gov

1 *Attorneys for Plaintiff New Jersey Division*
2 *of Consumer Affairs*

1 **LETITIA JAMES**

2 Attorney General
2 State of New York

3 /s/ Christopher D'Angelo

4 Christopher D'Angelo, Chief Deputy
5 Attorney General, Economic Justice
5 Division (NY Bar No. 4348744)
6 Christopher.D'Angelo@ag.ny.gov
7 Kim Berger, Chief, Bureau of Internet and
7 Technology (NY Bar No. 2481679)
8 Kim.Berger@ag.ny.gov
9 Clark Russell, Deputy Chief, Bureau of
9 Internet and Technology (NY Bar No.
9 2848323)
10 Clark.Russell@ag.ny.gov
11 Nathaniel Kosslyn, Assistant Attorney
11 General (NY Bar No. 5773676)
11 Nathaniel.Kosslyn@ag.ny.gov
12 New York State Office of the Attorney
12 General
13 28 Liberty Street
13 New York, NY 10005
14 (212) 416-8262
15 *Pro hac vice applications forthcoming, if
15 required*

16 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State
17 of New York*

1 **JOSHUA H. STEIN**

2 Attorney General
2 State of North Carolina

3 /s/ Kevin Anderson

4 Kevin Anderson (N.C. Bar No. 22635), *pro
4 hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
5 Senior Counsel
6 Sarah G. Boyce
6 Deputy Attorney General & General Counsel
7 Jasmine McGhee
7 Senior Deputy Attorney General
8 Josh Abram
8 Kunal Choksi
9 Special Deputy Attorneys General
9 Charles G. White
10 Assistant Attorney General
10 N.C. Department of Justice
10 Post Office Box 629
11 Raleigh, North Carolina 27602
11 Telephone: (919) 716-6006
11 Facsimile: (919) 716-6050
11 kander@ncdoj.gov

12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North
13 Carolina*

1 **DREW H. WRIGLEY**
2 Attorney General
3 State of North Dakota

4 By: /s/ Elin S. Alm
5 Elin S. Alm (ND Bar No. 05924)
6 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
7 Assistant Attorney General
8 Parrell D. Grossman (ND Bar No. 04684)
9 Director, Consumer Protection and Antitrust
10 Division
11 Office of Attorney General
12 1720 Burlington Drive, Suite C
13 Bismarck, ND 58504-7736
14 Telephone (701) 328-5570
15 ealm@nd.gov
16 pgrossman@nd.gov

17 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North Dakota,*
18 *ex rel. Drew H. Wrigley, Attorney General*

19 **DAVE YOST**
20 Attorney General
21 State of Ohio

22 /s/ Kevin R. Walsh
23 Melissa G. Wright (Ohio Bar No. 0077843)
24 Section Chief, Consumer Protection Section
25 Melissa.Wright@ohioago.gov
26 Melissa S. Smith (Ohio Bar No. 0083551)
27 Asst. Section Chief, Consumer Protection
28 Section
29 Melissa.S.Smith@ohioago.gov
30 Michael S. Ziegler (Ohio Bar No. 0042206)
31 Principal Assistant Attorney General
32 Michael.Ziegler@ohioago.gov
33 Kevin R. Walsh (Ohio Bar No. 0073999)
34 Kevin.Walsh@ohioago.gov
35 Senior Assistant Attorney General
36 30 East Broad Street, 14th Floor
37 Columbus, Ohio 43215
38 Tel: 614-466-1031
39 *(pro hac vice application forthcoming, if*
40 *required)*

41 *Attorneys for State of Ohio, ex rel. Attorney*
42 *General Dave Yost,*

43 **ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM**
44 Attorney General
45 State of Oregon

46 /s/ Jordan M. Roberts
47 Jordan M. Roberts (Oregon Bar No.
48 115010), *pro hac vice app. forthcoming, if*
49 *required*
50 Assistant Attorney General
51 Oregon Department of Justice
52 Consumer Protection Section
53 100 SW Market Street
54 Portland, Oregon 97201
55 Telephone: (971) 673-1880
56 Facsimile: (971) 673-1884
57 E-mail: jordan.m.roberts@doj.state.or.us

58 *Attorneys for State of Oregon, ex rel. Ellen*
59 *F. Rosenblum, Attorney General for the*
60 *State of Oregon*

1 **MICHELLE A. HENRY**
2 Attorney General
3 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

4 /s/ Timothy R. Murphy
5 **TIMOTHY R. MURPHY**
6 Senior Deputy Attorney General (PA Bar
7 No. 321294)
8 Email: tmurphy@attorneygeneral.gov
9 **JONATHAN R. BURNS**
10 Deputy Attorney General (PA Bar No.
11 315206)
12 Email: jburns@attorneygeneral.gov
13 Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General
14 Strawberry Square, 14th Floor
15 Harrisburg, PA 17120
16 Tel: 717.787.4530
17 *(pro hac vice application forthcoming, if
18 required)*

19 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of
20 Pennsylvania*

21 **PETER F. NERONHA**
22 Attorney General
23 State of Rhode Island

24 /s Stephen N. Provazza
25 Stephen N. Provazza (R.I. Bar No. 10435),
26 *pro hac vice app. forthcoming*
27 Special Assistant Attorney General
28 Rhode Island Office of the Attorney General
 150 South Main St.
 Providence, RI 02903
 Phone: 401-274-4400
 Email: SProvazza@riag.ri.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island

1 **ALAN WILSON**
2 Attorney General
3 State of South Carolina

4 /s/ Anna C. Smith
5 **C. HAVIRD JONES, JR.**
6 Senior Assistant Deputy Attorney General
7 **JARED Q. LIBET**
8 Assistant Deputy Attorney General
9 **ANNA C. SMITH** (SC Bar No. 104749), *pro
10 hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
11 Assistant Attorney General
12 **CLARK C. KIRKLAND, JR.**
13 Assistant Attorney General
14 **OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY
15 GENERAL OF SOUTH CAROLINA**
16 P.O. Box 11549
17 Columbia, South Carolina 29211
18 Tel: (803) 734-0536
19 annasmith@scag.gov

20 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of South
21 Carolina, ex rel. Alan M. Wilson, in His
22 Official Capacity as
23 Attorney General of the State of South
24 Carolina*

25 **MARTY J. JACKLEY**
26 Attorney General
27 State of South Dakota

28 /s/ Jessica M. LaMie
 By: Jessica M. LaMie (SD Bar No. 4831),
 *pro hac vice application forthcoming, if
 required*
 Assistant Attorney General
 1302 East Highway 14, Suite 1
 Pierre, SD 57501-8501
 Telephone: (605) 773-3215
 Jessica.LaMie@state.sd.us

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of South Dakota

1 **JASON S. MIYARES**
2 Attorney General
3 Commonwealth Of Virginia

4 /s/ Joelle E. Gotwals
5 Steven G. Popps
6 Deputy Attorney General
7 Richard S. Schweiker, Jr.
8 Senior Assistant Attorney General and
9 Section Chief
10 Joelle E. Gotwals (VSB No. 76779), *pro hac
11 vice app. forthcoming, if required*
12 Assistant Attorney General
13 Office of the Attorney General of Virginia
14 Consumer Protection Section
15 202 N. 9th Street
16 Richmond, Virginia 23219
17 Telephone: (804) 786-8789
18 Facsimile: (804) 786-0122
19 E-mail: jgotwals@oag.state.va.us

20 *Attorneys for the Plaintiff Commonwealth of
21 Virginia
22 ex rel. Jason S. Miyares, Attorney General*

23 **ROBERT W. FERGUSON**
24 Attorney General
25 State of Washington

26 /s/ Joseph Kanada
27 Joseph Kanada (WA Bar No. 55055), *pro
28 hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
29 Alexandra Kory
30 Rabi Lahiri
31 Gardner Reed
32 Alexia Diorio
33 Assistant Attorneys General
34 Washington State Office of the Attorney
35 General
36 800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000
37 Seattle, WA 98104
38 (206) 389-3843
39 Joe.Kanada@atg.wa.gov

40 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Washington*

41 **PATRICK MORRISEY**
42 Attorney General
43 State of West Virginia

44 /s/ Laurel K. Lackey
45 Laurel K. Lackey (WVSB No. 10267), *pro
46 hac vice app. forthcoming, if required*
47 Abby G. Cunningham (WVSB No. 13388)
48 Assistant Attorneys General
49 Office of the Attorney General
50 Consumer Protection & Antitrust Division
51 Eastern Panhandle Office
52 269 Aikens Center
53 Martinsburg, West Virginia 25404
54 (304) 267-0239
55 laurel.k.lackey@wvago.gov

56 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of West Virginia,
57 ex rel. Patrick Morrisey, Attorney General*

1 **JOSHUA L. KAUL**

2 Attorney General
2 State of Wisconsin

3 /s/ R. Duane Harlow

4 R. DUANE HARLOW
4 Assistant Attorney General
5 WI State Bar #1025622, *pro hac vice app*
5 *forthcoming, if required*
6 Wisconsin Department of Justice
7 Post Office Box 7857
7 Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857
8 (608) 266-2950
8 harlowrd@doj.state.wi.us

9
10 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin*

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2 * *In compliance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), the filer of this document attests under penalty of
perjury that all signatories have concurred in the filing of this document.*

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28